

# Keystone Literature

## *Starlings in Winter*

### Handscoring Anchor Set

Read the following poem. Then answer questions 10–16 in your answer book.

## Starlings in Winter

by Mary Oliver

Chunky and noisy,  
but with stars in their black feathers,  
they spring from the telephone wire  
and instantly

they are acrobats  
in the freezing wind.  
And now, in the theater of air,  
they swing over buildings,

dipping and rising;  
they float like one stippled star ...  
that opens,  
becomes for a moment fragmented,

then closes again;  
and you watch  
and you try  
but you simply can't imagine

how they do it  
with no articulated instruction, no pause,  
only the silent confirmation  
that they are this notable thing,

this wheel of many parts, that can rise and spin  
over and over again,  
full of gorgeous life.  
Ah, world, what lessons you prepare for us,

even in the leafless winter;  
even in the ashy city.  
I am thinking now  
of grief, and of getting past it;

I feel my boots  
trying to leave the ground,  
I feel my heart  
pumping hard, I want

to think again of dangerous and noble things.  
I want to be light and frolicsome.  
I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,  
as though I had wings.

Scoring Guide  
Passage Title: Starlings in Winter

Read the line from the poem.

**“I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,”**

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

Score	Description
<b><u>3</u></b>	The response is a clear, complete, and accurate analysis of how the line relates to the starlings. The response includes relevant and specific information from the poem.
<b><u>2</u></b>	The response is a partial analysis of how the line relates to the starlings. The response includes limited information from the poem and may include inaccuracies.
<b><u>1</u></b>	The response is a minimal analysis of how the line relates to the starlings. The response includes little or no information from the poem and may include inaccuracies. OR The response relates minimally to the task.
<b><u>0</u></b>	The response is totally incorrect or irrelevant or contains insufficient information to demonstrate comprehension.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

In this line, the author is expressing how badly she wants to be like the carefree starlings that can fly. She does so by saying that she wants to be improbable, beautiful, and afraid of nothing, which the reader can infer are all adjectives she is using to describe the starlings, and therefore express how badly she wants to live like them. She believes the starlings are improbable because of the way they fly, "dipping and rising," with what one can infer is no real set pattern. She believes the starlings are beautiful because they have "stars in their black feathers" and are "acrobats in the freezing wind," both of which would be beautiful things to look at or witness. In addition, she believes that the starlings are afraid of nothing, the way they "spring from the telephone wire," not afraid of falling to their deaths because they know they have wings which empower them to rise up and move on, not fall hopelessly to their doom, which what the author really wants for herself.

991 / 1000

**A-1: Scorepoint 3** - The student has given a clear, complete, and accurate analysis by making inferences based on analysis of a poem. The student has explained how the line relates to the starlings (*"the author is expressing how badly she wants to be like the carefree starlings that can fly....She believes the starlings are improbable because of the way they fly...with what one can infer is no real set pattern. She believes the starlings are beautiful...which would be beautiful things to look at or witness. In addition, she believes that the starlings are afraid of nothing...not afraid of falling to their deaths because they know they have wings which empower them to rise up and move on, not fall hopelessly to their doom, which what the author really wants for herself"*). The student supports the analysis with relevant and specific information from the poem (*"dipping and rising...stars in their black feathers...acrobats in the freezing wind...spring from the telephone wire"*).

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The line "I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing" relates to the starlings because of the way the author views them. She sees the starlings as a beautiful part of nature as she observes their flight. The way that they fly "full of gorgeous life" allows her to appreciate the simple beauty of their existence in nature. Also, the starlings appear to her to be "afraid of nothing". The way in which they fly with no instruction or doubt of themselves makes them seem fearless. In her eyes she is able to see the starlings as "improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing" and wants to embody the same spirit.

**A-2: Scorepoint 3** - The student has given a clear, complete, and accurate analysis by making inferences based on analysis of a poem. The student has explained how the line relates to the starlings ("because of the way the author views them. She sees the starlings as a beautiful part of nature as she observes their flight. The way that they fly... allows her to appreciate the simple beauty of their existence in nature. The way in which they fly... makes them seem fearless. In her eyes she is able to see the starlings as 'improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing' and wants to embody the same spirit"). The student supports the analysis with relevant and specific information from the poem ("they fly 'full of gorgeous life'...the starlings appear to her to be 'afraid of nothing'...they fly with no instruction or doubt of themselves").

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This line directly relates to starlings. The line describes how the person wants to be beautiful, and in the poem starlings are described as "full of gorgeous life". Therefore showing the connection between how the person wants to be beautiful and how the starlings are full of gorgeous life. The person also mentions the need of being afraid of nothing. This can relate to the starlings in how they are described at the beginning of this poem, as being "acrobats" and how they "swing over buildings". These are both dangerous activities, and show that the starlings are indeed afraid of nothing. Therefore the quote relates to the starlings through their beauty and fearlessness.

682 / 1000

**A-3: Scorepoint 3** - The student has given a clear, complete, and accurate analysis by making inferences based on analysis of a poem. The student has explained how the line relates to the starlings (*"The line describes how the person wants to be beautiful, and in the poem starlings are described as 'full of gorgeous life'. Therefore showing the connection between how the person wants to be beautiful and how the starlings are full of gorgeous life. The person also mentions the need of being afraid of nothing. This can relate to the starlings in how they are described at the beginning of this poem...These are both dangerous activities, and show that the starlings are indeed afraid of nothing. Therefore the quote relates to the starlings through their beauty and fearlessness"*). The student supports the analysis with relevant and specific information from the poem (*"full of gorgeous life...acrobats...swing over buildings"*).

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The speaker of the poem admires the way in which the starlings fly. They are compared to acrobats and performers, springing from their telephone wire perches completely unafraid. With that in mind, the speaker wants to be more like the birds: fearless and determined. Inspired by the birds, the speaker desires to shed their own grief and take on a new perspective on life.

378 / 1000

**A-4: Scorepoint 2** - The student has given a partial analysis by making inferences based on analysis of a poem. The student has partially explained how the line relates to the starlings (*"The speaker of the poem admires the way in which the starlings fly...the speaker wants to be more like the birds: fearless and determined. Inspired by the birds, the speaker desires to shed their own grief and take on a new perspective on life"*). The student supports the analysis with limited information from the poem (*"They are compared to acrobats and performers, springing from their telephone wire perches completely unafraid"*).



Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This line relates to starlings in a number of ways. One way that I think it relates to the starlings is because starlings are beautiful. They just fall from the sky which makes them afraid of nothing. In the passage it says, "they swing over buildings." By just reading that right there you can tell that the starlings are afraid of nothing. So the line, "I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing," definitely relates to the starlings in this passage.

**A-5: Scorepoint 2** - The student has given a partial analysis by making inferences based on analysis of a poem. The student has partially explained how the line relates to the starlings ("One way that I think it relates to the starlings is because starlings are beautiful. They just fall from the sky which makes them afraid of nothing...By just reading that right there you can tell that the starlings are afraid of nothing"). The student supports the analysis with limited information from the poem ("They just fall from the sky...they swing over buildings").



Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The guy in the poem is relating himself to wanting to be like the starlings, who he believes are bold and look good. He believes they are bold because they fly in and out of the city between buildings and over roofs. He thinks they look good. He called them beautiful and I guess he wants to look like and be like them.

The guy in the poem is relating himself to wanting to be like the starlings, who he believes are bold and look good. He believes they are bold because they fly in and out of the city between buildings and over roofs. He thinks they look good. He called them beautiful and I guess he wants to look like and be like them.

**A-6: Scorepoint 2** - The student has given a partial analysis by making inferences based on analysis of a poem. The student has partially explained how the line relates to the starlings ("The guy in the poem is relating himself to wanting to be like the starlings, who he believes are bold and look good...He thinks they look good. He called them beautiful and I guess he wants to look like and be like them"). The student supports the analysis with limited information from the poem ("they fly in and out of the city between buildings and over roofs...He called them beautiful").

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The speaker wants to be beautiful, because in the speaker's opinion, the starlings of winter are beautiful. The speaker also compares being fearless to the starlings flying, as they do.

190 / 1000

**A-7: Scorepoint 1** - The student has given a minimal analysis by making inferences based on analysis of a poem. The student has minimally explained how the line relates to the starlings (*"The speaker wants to be beautiful, because in the speaker's opinion, the starlings of winter are beautiful"*). The student uses little information from the poem (*"The speaker also compares being fearless to the starlings flying, as they do"*) to support the analysis.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This line relates to the starlings because they seem unafraid of everything. Starlings fly off wires and swing over buildings, and how starlings just go with the flow.

**A-8: Scorepoint 1** - The student has given a minimal analysis by making inferences based on analysis of a poem. The student has minimally explained how the line relates to the starlings ("because they seem unafraid of everything...starlings just go with the flow"). The student uses little information from the poem ("Starlings fly off wires and swing over buildings") to support the analysis.

1

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This line relates to the writer and the starlings because the writer wants to be like the starling which is the topic of this poem.

**A-9: Scorepoint 1** - The student has given a minimal analysis of a poem. The student has minimally explained how the line relates to the starlings using little information from the passage ("because the writer wants to be like the starling which is the topic of this poem").

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The narrator wants to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing. This means that the narrator wants to be brave and good looking.

134 / 1000

**A-10: Scorepoint 0** - The student has given a response to the task that contains insufficient information to demonstrate comprehension.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The line from the poem "I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing" relates to the starlings because they both relate to a good life.

**A-11: Scorepoint 0** - The student has given a response to the task that contains insufficient information to demonstrate comprehension.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This line relates to the starlings by  
you shouldn't be afraid of nothing and don't  
let anybody tell you that you are ugly.  
You should be confident about yourself and  
think positive.

**A-12: Scorepoint 0** - The student has given a response to the task that is totally irrelevant.



This Page Intentionally Blank

# Keystone Literature

*Starlings in Winter*

Handscoring  
Training Set 1

This Page Intentionally Blank

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The author sees starlings as beautiful creatures that aren't afraid of anything. For instance in the passage, the author describes how starlings, "are acrobats in the freezing wind. And now, in the theater of air, they swing over buildings." This quote shows how even though most birds have migrated in the winter, the starlings are still flying around more thrifty than ever, which shows that they really don't possess any fear. Another quote describes how they are equipped with, "stars in their black feather," which is describing the beauty of the starling. So the first quote has everything to do with starlings as the author envies their beauty and courage.

665 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing" relates to the starlings. For example the author says "chunky and noisy but with stars in their black feathers, the spring from the telephone wire and instantly they are acrobats in the freezing wind". This shows that with their feathers they are beautiful, and with their ability to spring from telephone lines makes them fearless.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This relates to the starlings because the starlings are beautiful and afraid of nothing and when the writer looks at them that's how he wants to feel.

149 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

Starlings are birds. They are scary.

36 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This line relates to the starlings because starlings are free, they can do anything. In the poem it says that she tries to leave the ground; she wants to be free. When you have the freedom to do anything you don't have to be afraid of anything. When she says I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing, as though I had wings. She is saying herself that the starlings are beautiful and are afraid of nothing.

418 / 1000



T

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

In this line, the woman is saying how she wants to be just like the starlings. She believes the starlings have amazing beauty in all ways. For example, she notes their physical beauty by talking about their black feathers with stars on them. She also admires their beauty in other ways, such as their movement. She states how their movement dips and rises, and how when they fly they remind her of stars in the sky. The woman also envies the starling lack of fear. She notes how they spring off of the telephone lines and float and fly in the air as if it's no big deal. The author wishes that she could live her life the way the starlings do every day.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

In the poem, the author describes the starlings as being lively and joyful. She also describes a scene where they "spring" from a telephone wire, which in a way portrays bravery. The author uses this line to do two things. One being that she wants to act like them. But it also describes (or relates) to the starlings by depicting their brave and lively nature.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

She wants to be just like a  
starling. Starlings have no fear as they  
fly around the air and the speaker  
wishes that she had that kind of  
courage.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The birds that she is talking about are called  
starlings that rovers they sit on a telephone  
wire there is nothing great about them. I  
see them every day they suck.

Read the line from the poem,

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The author wants to be  
like the bird beautiful and  
careless going wherever it goes and  
fearless. That is what this  
phrase means.

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Number	Score	Notes
T1-1		
T1-2		
T1-3		
T1-4		
T1-5		
T1-6		
T1-7		
T1-8		
T1-9		
T1-10		

This Page Intentionally Blank

# Keystone Literature

*Starlings in Winter*

Handscoring  
Training Set 2



This Page Intentionally Blank

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The way the line relates to the starlings is she wants to be like them, be full of life and be fearless and free as if she can fly.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

Mary Oliver says how the starlings are "acrobats in the freezing wind. And now, in the theatre of air, they swing over building." she describes them like they are very fearless and improbable by swinging over building and being acrobats in the night air. Mary Oliver also describes their feather pattern of having stars in their black feathers which makes them sound very beautiful like Mary Oliver wants to be.

411 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,". This quote from the passage is explaining multiple things. First it is describing the starlings as "improbable beautiful" which she says many times in the passage. For example when the poet writes, "full of gorgeous life", she is explaining how beautiful the starlings can fly through the air with a carefree ease, that they can spin, dip and rise just as though it's the easiest thing in the world. Next when the poet writes that the starlings are "afraid of nothing" she is saying again how they can be "in the theater of air" and have nothing weighing them down. They fly through the air with such grace that it shows that they are never afraid of the world such as us humans. Humans could never be so "light and frolicsome", not because we do not have wings but it is because we are afraid of everything.

867 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

she wants everything to be perfect.

36 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

It relates to the starlings because the starlings are described as being beautiful, and they are way up high in the sky, so they wouldn't be afraid of anything.

160 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

They want us to be who we are, our own individual.

60 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The starlings themselves could easily be described as beautiful and afraid of nothing. For example, when they fly from the phone wire and dance like acrobats in the air, they are fearless, not worrying about what will happen, they just do it. They're also beautiful, dancing about like acrobats in the air for anyone who is watching to see. That is why the starlings are "improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."



Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The last line of "Starlings in Winter" by Mary Oliver, it says "I want to be beautiful and afraid of nothing." The author is comparing this to the starlings in winter. She believes starlings to be improbable. This is evident when she says "...but you simply cant imagine how they do it with no articulated instruction, no pause, ...". This means that the author has no idea when they will spring from the telephone wire. She also says how she desires to be beautiful like the starlings. She express how beautiful she believes the starlings are when she says, "...they float like one stripped star..." She compares the starlings beauty to the beauty of a stripped star. One last character trait the author wants from the starling is the ability to be be afraid of nothing. She calls them "acrobats in the freezing wind." In cocclusion, Mary Oliver desires three traits that the starlings posses; them being Improbability, beauty, and bravery.

942 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The starlings, as described by the author, are carefree and not burdened by instruction. The quote above relates to the starlings because the author does not want to be burdened by anything and to be carefree. Carefree and "afraid of nothing" are synonyms in a sense, so the quote relates. The author also sees the starlings full of "gorgeous life." She wants to be "beautiful" and have such "gorgeous life."

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

Starlings are beautiful and afraid of nothing  
that's why he wants to be like  
starlings

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Number	Score	Notes
T2-1		
T2-2		
T2-3		
T2-4		
T2-5		
T2-6		
T2-7		
T2-8		
T2-9		
T2-10		

This Page Intentionally Blank

# Keystone Literature

## *Starlings in Winter*

### Handscoring Practice Set\*

\*Responses in this set do not have true scores. Apply scores based on scoring criteria.

This Page Intentionally Blank

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This line from the poem could relate to the starlings in many ways. The writer wants to be a starling for obvious reasons. The starling is admired because of its beauty. Also because they are fearless when they are jumping over buildings and being like "acrobats". Finally the writer wants to be a starling because they have no stress or other problems of humans.



Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

I think this relates to the starlings because they are beautiful birds and they are not scared of anything and the person would like to be like the starling.

157 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This line relates to the starlings because they are otherwise impossible to describe.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This line relates to starlings because of how  
she says they are like stars in the sky and  
how beautiful and fearless they are.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The starlings in the poem "Starlings in Winter" written by Mary Oliver seem to be in a giddy, invincible type of mood. The starlings relate to the line of the poem "I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing." The starlings twist and turn in an improbable manner as they sprang from the telephone wire. They dazzle Oliver with their beauty as they twist and turn with silent consent in a continuous body of starlings. The starlings are described as afraid of nothing; they aren't afraid of the cold, flying, or the "ashy city." Oliver relates to the starlings as everything she wishes to be: improbable, beautiful, and afraid of nothing.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

This line relates to the starlings by stating that the man of this poem wants to be beautiful and elegant like the starlings. He also wants to be afraid of nothing like the starlings are as they swing over buildings and float ever so lightly in the freezing wind. He wants to be brave and courageous in his future as the starlings are in the city.

347 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing,"

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

I think the reader is saying the starlings are beautiful,  
and the author wishes to be as graceful and dexterous as the  
starlings.

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The starling wants to be able to fly.

38 / 1000

Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The line "I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing," can be simplified as just "I want to be a starling." The poem extols the beauty of starlings, calling them stars and acrobats. They flip through the winter air without any trouble making a fearless dance. Care-free, the glide; making the grief-filled author want to join. That is how the line relates to the starlings.



Read the line from the poem.

"I want to be improbable beautiful and afraid of nothing."

Analyze how the line relates to the starlings. Use information from the poem to support your analysis.

The line is really describing how the person in this poem would like to feel more like those starlings. The starlings improbability is how perfect their flight patterns are though they have not practiced it. Many times in the poem the character (who may be the author) takes note of the beauty of the birds themselves and of their intricate flying acrobatics. The very first thing he says in the poem is "but with stars in their black feathers" which describes the physical beauty of these birds in winter time. When character states in the next part of the sentence "and afraid of nothing". Here she is simply trying to describe how free and worryless it must feel to fly and get away from everything.

707 / 1000

## Practice Set\*

Subject: **Keystone Literature**

Item: **Starlings in Winter**

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Number	Score	Consensus	Notes
P-1			
P-2			
P-3			
P-4			
P-5			
P-6			
P-7			
P-8			
P-9			
P-10			

**\*Responses in this set do not have true scores. Apply scores based on scoring criteria.**

This Page Intentionally Blank

PSSA and Keystone Exams  
Fall 2015  
Item Writing and Handscoring Training Workshops

# Keystone Literature

*Starlings in Winter*

Handscoring  
Training Sets 1 and 2  
True Scores/  
Annotations

This Page Intentionally Blank

## **Keystone Literature - Starlings in Winter - Training Set One Annotations**

### **T1-1 Scorepoint 3**

- Analysis: *"The author sees starlings as beautiful creatures that aren't afraid of anything...even though most birds have migrated in the winter, the starlings are still flying around more thrifty than ever, which shows that they really don't possess any fear...describing the beauty of the starlings. So the first quotes has everything to do with starlings as the author envies their beauty and courage."*
- Relevant and specific information to support: *"are acrobats in the freezing wind. And now, in the theater of air, they swing over buildings...stars in their black feather."*

### **T1-2 Scorepoint 2**

- Partial analysis: *"This shows the that with their feathers they are beautiful, and with their ability to spring from telephone lines makes them fearless."*
- Limited information to support: *"chunky and noisy but with stars in their black feathers, the spring from the telephone wire and instantly they are acrobats in the freezing wind"*

### **T1-3 Scorepoint 1**

- Minimal analysis and little information: *"the starlings are beautiful and afraid of nothing and when the writer looks at them thats how he wants to feel."*

### **T1-4 Scorepoint 0**

- Response to the task is irrelevant and incorrect

### **T1-5 Scorepoint 2**

- Partial analysis: *"starlings are free, they can do anything. In the poem it says that...she wants to be free. When you have the freedom to do anything you don't have to be afraid of anything...She is saying herself that the starlings are beautiful and are afraid of nothing."*
- Limited information to support: *"she tries to leave the ground...as though I had wings."*

### **T1-6 Scorepoint 3**

- Analysis: *"the woman is saying how she wants to be just like the starlings. She believes the starlings have amazing beauty in all ways. For example, she notices their physical beauty...She also admires their beauty in other ways, such as their movement...The woman also envies the starling lack of fear... The author wishes that she could live her life the way the starlings do every day."*
- Relevant and specific information to support: *"their black feathers with stars on them...their movement dips and rises...when they fly they remind her of stars in the sky...they spring off of the telephone lines and float and fly in the air as if it's no big deal."*

### **T1-7 Scorepoint 2**

- Partial analysis: *"The author describes the starlings as being lively and joyful. She also describes a scene...which in a way portrays bravery. The author uses this line to do two things. One being that she wants to act like them. But it also describes (or relates) to the starlings by depicting their brave and lively nature."*
- Limited information to support: *"they 'spring' from a telephone wire."*

## Starlings in Winter - Training Set 1 Annotations Continued

### **T1-8 Scorepoint 1**

- Minimal analysis: *"She wants to be just like a starling. Starlings have no fear...and the speaker wishes that she had that kind of courage."*
- Little information to support: *"as they fly around the air."*

### **T1-9 Scorepoint 0**

- Response to the task is irrelevant

### **T1-10 Scorepoint 1**

- Minimal analysis and little information: *"The author wants to be like the bird beautiful and carefree going wherever it goes and fearless."*

## **Keystone Literature - Starlings in Winter - Training Set Two Annotations**

### **T2-1 Scorepoint 1**

- Minimal analysis and little information: *"she wants to be like them, be full of life and be fearless and free as if she can fly."*

### **T2-2 Scorepoint 2**

- Partial analysis: *"she describes them like they are very fearless and improbable by swinging over building and being acrobats in the night air. mary oliver also describes their feaather pattern...wich makes them sound very beautiful like mary oliver wants to be."*
- Limited information to support: *"acrobats in the freezing wind. And now, in the theatre of air, they swing over building...having stars in their black feathers."*

### **T2-3 Scorepoint 3**

- Analysis: *"it is describing the starlings...she is explaining how beautiful the starlings can fly through the air with a carefree ease, that they can spin, dip and rise just as though it's the easiest thing in the world...and have nothing weighing them down. They fly throught the air with such grace that it shoes that they are never afraid of the world such as us humans...not because we do not have wings but it is because we are afraid of everything."*
- Relevant and specific information to support: *"full of gorgeous life...spin, dip and rise...afraid of nothing...in the theater of air...light and frolicsome."*

### **T2-4 Scorepoint 0**

- Insufficient information to demonstrate comprehension

### **T2-5 Scorepoint 1**

- Minimal analysis: *"It relates to the starlings because the starlings are described as being beautiful, and they are way up high in the sky, so they woud'nt be afraid of anything."*
- Little information to support: *"way up high in the sky."*

### **T2-6 Scorepoint 0**

- Response to the task is incorrect and insufficient

### **T2-7 Scorepoint 2**

- Partial analysis: *"The starlings themselves could easily be described as beautiful and afraid of nothing...they are fearless, not worrying about what will happen, they just do it. They're also beautiful, dancing about like acrobats in the air for anyone who is watching to see."*
- Limited information to support: *"they fly from the phone wire and dance like acrobats in the air."*



## Starlings in Winter- Training Set 2 Annotations Continued

### T2-8 Scorepoint 3

- Analysis: *"She believes starlings to be improbable...This means that the author has no idea when they will spring from the telephone wire. She also says how she desires to be beautiful like the starlings. She express how beautiful she believes the starlings are...She compares the starlings beauty to the beauty of a stripped star. One last character trait the author wants from the starling is the ability to be be afraid of nothing...In cocnclusion, Mary Oliver desires three traits that the starlings posses; them being improbability, beauty, and bravery."*
- Relevant and specific information to support: *"but you simply cant imagine how they do it with no articulated instruction, no pause...they float like one stripped star...acrobats in the freezing wind."*

### T2-9 Scorepoint 2

- Partial analysis: *"The starlings, as described by the author, are carefree and not burdened by instruction. The quote above relates to the starlings because the author does not want to be burdened by anything and to be carefree. Carefree and 'afraid of nothing' are synonyms in a sense, so the quote relates."*
- Limited information to support: *"carefree and not burdened by instruction...full of 'gorgeous life'."*

### T2-10 Scorepoint 1

- Minimal analysis and little information: *"Starlings are beautiful and afraid of nothings thats why he wants to be like starlings."*